BULLETIN OF THE MUSEUM OF FINE ARTS

VOLUME L

BOSTON, OCTOBER, 1952

No. 281

The Mount of Calvary

German, Fifteenth Century

1951 Purchase Fund

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY

SUBSCRIPTION ONE DOLLAR
As to the pictorial side of the scroll, it may be said that the ascription of the work to Ma Ho-chih seems to be justified. It is true that there is no signature of the artist on any one of the six pictures: nevertheless the individual style peculiar to Ma Ho-chih is apparent in the drawing and in the treatment of the subjects. It compares well with such an example as the scroll of Odes from the group of Ta Ye in the Fuji Collection in Kyoto, which has been accepted as genuine. Then, too, the material used in the work indicates that it dates from the time of the artist. In the absence, however, of unimpeachable proof, it seems proper to designate the illustrations as "attributed to" Ma Ho-chih.

Before the scroll of the Six Odes entered into the Imperial Ch'ien-lung Collection, it was in the possession of Liang Ch'ing-p'iao (1620-1691), an official at the court of the Emperor Kang-hsi. Until recent years it belonged to Hsuan-tung, the last Emperor of China. The seals of these collectors are stamped on the scroll.

Ma Ho-chih's style has been characterized as transcending the commonplace and disregarding the vogue. His conception is classical and noble. In contrast to the fashion prevailing among his contemporaries, who vied with one another in producing pictures boldly executed in ink alone or delicately drawn with elegant coloring, he maintained his individuality, seeking his inspiration in the past. Is it any wonder that the Emperor Kao Tsung, who was influenced by the calligraphy of those older periods, favored Ma Ho-chih as the illustrator of his copies of the Odes? It is evident that in dealing with figure-subjects Ma Ho-chih aimed at refinement and sincerity; and in landscapes at quietude and pristine beauty.

Whoever were the artists responsible for the scroll, its calligraphy and drawing are important examples of the Southern Sung period.

KOJIRO TOMITA and 
A. KAIMING CHIU

PTOLEMAIC RELIEFS
II
Temple Decorations of Ptolemy I Soter

A STUDY of the origin and development of that particular Late Egyptian relief style which is called Ptolemaic has to take into account the strongly traditional trends which are so characteristic of Egyptian art, especially in its final stages. Almost imperceptible are the stylistic changes in reliefs made in the first decades after the conquest of Egypt by Alexander the Great. In the continuity of temple decoration the artisans faithfully followed the prevailing local style of earlier periods and sometimes, in restoring parts of older buildings, their imitative abilities were well nigh perfect. Scholars still disagree as to whether the figure of Tuthmosis III (ca. 1504-1450 B.C.) on the east wall of Room XXVIII in his festival temple at Karnak¹ was carved in the time of this great king of Dynasty XVIII or in the days when this part of the temple was restored at the behest of the Macedonian conqueror.

In a previous article² a relief of Philip Arrhidaeus was published which, although dating from the beginning of the Ptolemaic Period, had been cut in traditional style without showing any remarkable innovations. When after the death of Philip in 317 B.C. the infant Alexander, Roxane's son, nominally became king of Egypt, the satrap Ptolemy, being de facto ruler of the Nile valley, proceeded to decorate temples in the name of the new king, just as he had done on behalf of his predecessor. Again local tradition was observed, and the execution of the reliefs embodies the main features employed in reliefs of Dynasties XVIII to XXX.

In 310 B.C. the boy Alexander was murdered, but it was not until 305 B.C. that Ptolemy formally assumed the kingship of Egypt. As Ptolemy I Soter, with the full title of a successor to the pharaohs of yore, his name is found on the walls of a number of older temples which he restored. For obvious reasons they are not the place where one would expect to find noticeable changes of style, and therefore only buildings founded and decorated by Ptolemy after his ac-


Fig. 1. Lower part of the Hathor and Ptolemy I relief

Fig. 2. Ptolemy I Soter before Hathor. From Tarranah

Gift of the Egypt Exploration Fund, 1889

Fig. 3. Lower part of the Hathor and Ptolemy I relief

Glasgow
cession to the throne are of any help in tracing the evolution of Ptolemaic relief work. It is not known how many temples owe their existence to the founder of the Ptolemaic monarchy, but the remains of at least two have been discovered. Both are now completely destroyed and their reliefs dispersed. One temple of Ptolemy I must have stood near Sharūnā in Middle Egypt; another is known to have existed in the western Delta and from it came the reliefs which are illustrated in Figs. 1-8.

During the season of 1887-88 the late F. Ll. Griffith, on behalf of the Egypt Exploration Fund, did some work at Tarranah, the ancient Terenuthis. The site lies in the west of the Delta, at the edge of the desert, about two and one half miles south of the railroad station of Kafr Dāwūd. The nearby necropolis of the ancient town is now known as Kom Abu Billo, a lively description of which is contained in a letter written by Griffith to Amelia B. Edwards from Assiut in February, 1888. In the course of his exploration Griffith found, both at Tarranah and at Kom Abu Billo, displaced limestone blocks with decorations in low relief which had once formed part of the walls of a temple built by Ptolemy I Soter. Two of these blocks (Figs. 1-2) were presented to this Museum by the Egypt Exploration Fund in 1889.

Griffith soon discovered the temple site from which the limestone blocks had been taken. At the side of the road to the Wady, just at the crest of the rise to the desert hills. In later times the city of Terenuthis, founded at the edge of the desert, spread along the road until it reached the same point, and the mounds of Kūm abu Billo partly overlap the old temple site. The enclosure of this temple, with its chambers and the wall of the foundation, are still partly traceable, but not a single block of stone remains. The whole of the limestone had been cleared out of the loose sand and gravel, and I found a good part of it in the centre of the town built into a wall, the remnants of which are now fifteen feet in rubbish. Several feet above the foundation of this wall is a tile pavement with small marble columns lying upon it. It is evident that we have here the site of successive churches; and the earliest of them was built of stone taken direct from the pagan temple, and built in without any reworking. This reminds me of a passage quoted by Champollion from a Coptic author, where it is related that the governor of Letopolis, on receiving an imperial edict "in favour of Christianity, immediately pulled down the temple, and built churches on the site. It is seldom that limestone remains are found in the Delta. It is evident that the town grew very rapidly in height in the Coptic period; and the limestone walls were gradually buried in buildings outside, the pavement of the church being raised without moving the walls, and this contributed to the preservation of the lower courses... I did not work out the site completely, as it was not very promising. I have had all the interesting pieces of sculpture sawn off and taken to Bulaq, as the only means of saving them from the limekiln. A number of sculptured blocks have been found in former years, and taken to the village or built into saqiiefs... It is vexing to think of all the other blocks which Griffith noticed in Tarranah at that time and which are now probably lost, as their importance cannot be underestimated. First, as pointed out before, they are the only examples of reliefs from a newly founded temple of Ptolemy I for which, therefore, no locally established tradition could have set the style; and second, they are carved in low relief which reveals so much more of the peculiar features of a work of sculpture than does the more frequently employed sunk relief. It is impossible to determine the exact date at which the work on this temple was undertaken. The king's names are given in full; therefore the decorations were carved after 305 B.C. On the other hand, additional limestone reliefs were found there which bear the name of his successor, Ptolemy II Philadephus, but they are worked in sunk relief and seem to have formed part of the outside decoration of the temple walls. Thus it is safe to assume that the building was unfinished in 285 B.C. when Ptolemy II Philadephus was proclaimed king, and that the latter completed the decoration of the structure begun by his father some years earlier.

The temple of Tarranah, whose ground plan has not been recorded, was enclosed by a temenos wall measuring sixty-five by fifty-eight yards. The building cannot have been very high since most of the blocks, some of them sculptured on both faces, were only eight inches thick, although they may have come from the interior walls. The temple was dedicated to Hathor, the great mother goddess, whose sacred animal was the cow, and a nearby cattle cemetery indicates the high esteem in which the place was held. In the inscription on the Glasgow block (Fig. 3) the goddess is addressed as Mistress of Maftul; this being the ancient Egyptian name of Tarranah. Three blocks with the cartouches of earlier kings which have been noticed at and near the site are no proof to the contrary. They may have been brought from another place; see Porter and Moss, op. cit.


"..."
tical with the Egyptian word for "turquoise"¹⁲ from which the place name of the turquoise mines in the southwest of the Sinai Peninsula was derived. Hathor was the protectress of that site, and when the name was given to the region of modern Tarraneh, Hathor, being so closely associated with the original Maaket, became the patroness of the new town of that name. Her connection with the turquoise mines is easily explained by the color symbolism involved.¹³ Turquoise is of green color, and green, to the Egyptians, was the color which symbolized "Life," "Growth," "Fertility," "Health," and "Good Fortune." The emblem of Hathor is the papyrus plant (Fig. 2) whose very name in Egyptian is "The Green One" and with which the word for "green" was written in hieroglyphic inscriptions. The cow of Hathor is often represented emerging from the luscious thickets of green papyrus plants. Green amulets were considered especially strong as protection, and thus green turquoise was in great demand for beads and pendants. No wonder that the goddess of the "green" scepter became associated with the arid place where the green semiprecious stone was mined.

The Greek name of Maaket, Ternouthitis,¹¹ from which Tarranneh is derived, does not appear to have been used before Roman times. It is composed with the name of the goddess Ermotet who, as deity of harvest fertility, was worshipped in the form of a snake; but it is not known when the cow of Hathor yielded to the beneficent serpent of Ermotet.

The limestone reliefs of Tarranneh are now mostly devoid of their original coloring, but some of them have preserved enough polychrome traces to give an indication of the richness and splendor by which they must have excelled in ancient days. The block in Boston, illustrated in Fig. 1, despite the damage which the surface has suffered, still shows ample paint on the wings of the hawks. The bold brush strokes are dark blue to black, the intermediate strokes are red. The sun discs were of red color, and the background was probably light red or brown. These falcons, resting on the Gold sign, hold the scepter of Lordship with the ring of Encirclement, an allegory of the king's dominion, his rule over all that is encircled by the sun. They flank two cartouches, each of which stands on the Gold sign and is surmounted by the sun disc. Within the cartouches the king's name is written. In the left group, the right cartouche contains his prenomen, The One Whom Ra Has Chosen, The Beloved of Amun, while the nomen, Pothmis, is written in the left cartouche.

The final stroke of the prenomen, probably left off by the stone cutter, is applied in color, and there are other indications that the painter somewhat improved the sketchy relief work.

In the right group the cartouches are reversed; it should be noted that here the inside of the far wings of the falcons is shown. An inscription over each bird identifies it as the god Horus of Behdet, the crowning caption of most royal representations. The slab formed probably part of the top course of a wall; that it belonged at its left end is shown by the undressed portion protruding at the left where the adjoining wall abutted at right angles.

The other slab in the Museum's collection¹⁴ (Fig. 2) is decorated with a representation of Ptolemy I proffering incense to the goddess Hathor who holds her emblem, the papyrus scepter. Of the inscription above only traces are preserved; it may suffice to point out the ends of the two cartouches over the king which contained his name. Also the legend behind him contains a cartouche of Ptolemy I and is followed by an invocation of the deity. In the column of inscription to the left of Hathor the wish is expressed that she may take possession of the land as far as the Great Green,¹⁵ the Egyptian term for the Mediterranean Sea.

The carving of this representation is especially fine and probably offers the best example of royal low relief from the time of Ptolemy I. As the raised undressed portion on the left indicates, the block stood at the left end of a wall, possibly in the second or third course from the top. The only traces of paint noticeable today are a faint yellow on the neck of Hathor and spots of bright red on the skin of the king. The goddess wears a lappet wig, tied with a ribbon and adorned with two uraei.¹⁶ The chubby features of the deity are not very distinct, but the ear is deepely carved and modeled in great detail. The circular depression on the earlobe hints at the piece of jewelry customarily worn by ladies. The narrow eyebrow is marked in low relief, just as is the cosmetic line which continues the sweep of the upper eyelid rim. The broad collar, now so simple but formerly articulate with painted detail, is bordered by a string of beads, while the ample round of a well-formed breast accentuates the slimness of the goddess' waist. The king's torso is broader, but, on the whole, less modeled. He, too, wears the broad collar with a raised rim. A bag wig,
doubly outlined over the face, covers his head and is surmounted by the uraeus. The ear, though shaped differently from that of the goddess, is equally elaborate and deeply carved. Eyebrow and cosmetic line are plastic, but not quite as precise as those of Hathor. His chin line shows the double swoop which is characteristic during this period, and the same holds true for the goddess’ features. His cheek, however, is set off against the neck while hers is not, and the eye socket is markedly depressed. But the hands are the most expressive part of the king’s figure.

With fingers overly elongated, slightly opened, and strongly recurved, these hands convey a gesture which is emphasized by the extent to which the fingers are raised above the background. In the strict sense of the term, as applied to Egyptian art, they are not carved in relief, but are worked three-quarters in the round, and the fingernails, in their natural position, are outlined almost in their full width. The index finger of the hand holding the incense vessel is undercut where its upper contour meets the background, a feature of no mean importance. It should also be noted
how strongly the abdomen protrudes under the upper arm; clearly a school of sculptors was here at work which tried to break away from the bondage of accepted tradition.

Although the adjoining block from the course below is missing, a slab from the third course, now in the Glasgow Art Gallery and Museums, has preserved at least part of the base of the Boston scene (Fig. 3). That the identification is correct can hardly be doubted. The raised undressed portion on the left fixes the position of the block in the wall; the long garment of the left figure shows that she is female, and the distance between her feet and the foot on the right corresponds exactly to that expected from the two figures on the Boston relief according to the canon of the period. Moreover, the bold vertical line in front of the lady's toes represents the pointed end of Hathor's papyrus scepter. The two hieroglyphs on its right are the end of the king's address, probably referring to his act of censing, while the signs to the left of the stem are the conclusion of the missing reply of the goddess. The short stroke ending at the level of the garment's hem is the lower part of the columnar line to the left of Hathor's reply. Behind her feet is the bottom of the column of inscription, part of which appears on the Boston slab (Fig. 2). It ends with the word Eternity, the same word which stands in the line below the figures to the left of Ptolemy's cartouche (Fig. 3). As mentioned before, the rest of the inscription invokes Hathor, Mistress of Market.

There are four more pieces of relief from the temple at Tarraneh in American collections. A block in Princeton (Fig. 4) is decorated with a frieze of stars which forms the top of an inscription frequently found above scenes in which the king is represented. The only variance in each case is offered by the names of the persons involved, and thus we have here on the far right the name of Hathor, the Glorious One, the Soul... To the left appear the cartouches of Ptolemy I Soter, the prenome being introduced by the customary title The Good God, The Lord of the Two Lands, and the nomen by The Son of Ra, The Lord of the Crowns. The left column shows the sun disc of the god Horus-Ra with two uraei (the left one now missing) which are adorned with the signs of Life and, below it, of Stability and Lordship. The signs under the sun disc refer to Horus-Ra, The Behdetite, The Lord of Heaven. On a similar block from Tarranneh in Philadelphia (Fig. 5) the prenome is introduced by King of Upper and Lower Egypt, Lord of the Two Lands, and the sign of Life, suspended from the serpent's body, is followed immediately by that of Lordship.

More interesting in subject matter is the second relief in Philadelphia (Fig. 6) which shows the king's bust, somewhat damaged and partially restored in plaster on the right, and an inscription on the left whose middle section (the Horus hawk within a square) names the goddess Hathor to whom the column underneath is addressed. It contains the beginning of an old ritual text: Take unto thee the eye (of Horus). The workmanship of this relief is similar to that of the Boston block (Fig. 2), but the surface of the hieroglyphs is more rounded. The king's headress lacks the double outline over the forehead which appears on the Boston relief; yet the ear is carved in exactly the same manner, with great attention to detail. It should be noted, however, that this relief is executed on a smaller scale than that illustrated in Fig. 2, and so it appears unlikely that the two once belonged to the same wall.

The third relief in the Philadelphia collection (Fig. 7) comes from the base of a wall decoration of the temple at Tarraneh where a group of gods faced to the right. The line of inscription underneath, running from left to right, reads: Lord of the Crowns, Ptolemy, living like Ra forever. The feet belong to two gods whose identities remain unknown. The one on the right wears, as part of his costume, the bull's tail, age-old insignia of the king's power, which also frequently adorns a god's dress. The deity on the left holds a scepter, identified by its forked end, which denotes Lordship. In front of the shin, the bottom of the columnar line becomes visible: between it and the end of the scepter one hieroglyph of the god's speech is preserved. Although somewhat less carefully worked than the relief of the Glasgow
block (Fig. 3), as may be seen in the modeling of the toes, it has, however, nearly the same scale as the Boston and Glasgow reliefs and could have belonged to a parallel representation on the opposite wall.

Another slab from the Tarraneh temple, now in Oxford (Fig. 8), bears a relief decoration of two panels separated by a column of inscription. Both figures represent the king facing left in the direction of the deity. There is no doubt that it is Hathor, and the beginning of the text reads The Glorious One, an attribute which also occurs on the block in Princeton (Fig. 4). The first four hieroglyphs face to the right in keeping with the direction of the goddess; the rest of the inscription faces the other way to correspond to the figures of Ptolemy I. F. W. von Bissing, the first to publish this relief, noted traces of red on the skin, yellow on the skirt, and grey on the background. He stressed, too, the extraordinary "roundness" of the modeling, which is also noticeable on the Boston block. Both figures of the king are very much alike. Headdress and ornaments are the same as on the Boston relief (Fig. 2), except that on the latter the head is better carved where such a detail as the double outline of the bag wig over the forehead represents a more finished state than that of the Oxford relief. But here more of the king's body is preserved. His dress consists of a kilt; tucked under its belt is the bull's tail, the lower part of which appears on the Philadelphia slab (Fig. 7) in the representation of a god.

Fig. 7. Feet of Gods
Philadelphia

The action of the left figure of the king in the Oxford relief is not clear, but on the right the inscription under his raised arm proclaims: Giving praise to his mother, offering (incense) . . . . The hand holding the censer and the handle of the ritual instrument are now lost, but the bowl with flaming incense is preserved in front of the king's thigh.

This representation of Ptolemy I Soter, bringing various offerings to the goddess, is done on a smaller scale than the Boston relief and therefore must have belonged to a different wall scene. However, the measurements correspond closely to those of the second Philadelphia relief (Fig. 6) with which it also has in common the arrangement of the vertical inscription alternating with the representation of the king. Therefore it is most likely that these two reliefs belong to the same scene and with other representations, now lost,
features can be observed elsewhere on these reliefs.

The question now arises whence these innovations came, as they cannot be found in low-relief temple decorations of the preceding period. The answer is furnished by the private reliefs of the early Ptolemaic Period whose style was not subject to the same rigid traditional laws as was royal work. There are numerous examples of late fourth century reliefs from private tombs which demonstrate this new trend, and in this case it is perhaps justified to attribute the development to "Greek influence," a term often wrongly applied and still not properly defined as far as Late Egyptian art is concerned. There are indeed many Greek motifs to be found in these private reliefs, and nothing is proven by pointing out that similar motifs may have occurred on Egyptian reliefs hundreds or thousands of years before. They occur, or re-occur, now under Greek influence, as for instance the calf bearer in a relief at Brooklyn, whose head, in true Hellenistic fashion, is turned out from the background and faces the observer.

BERNARD V. BOTHMER

33 Cf. the reliefs of Nectanebo II (Dynasty XXX) in the Walters Art Gallery, Baltimore, and in The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; The Journal of the Walters Art Gallery, 7-8 (1944-45), pp. 45-46, figs. 6-7. In spite of the strong surface modulation which points the way to the later development, the three-dimensional indications are still absent in these reliefs.

34 E.g. Encyclopédie photographique de l'Art; Le Musée du Caire (Paris, 1949), figs. 185-191; H. Ranke, The Egyptian Collections of the Museum (Philadelphia, 1940), pp. 41-72, fig. 44 (Acc. No. E 14516. Height 27.4 cm.; length 29.1 cm.).

35 Brooklyn Museum, Brooklyn, N. Y. Acc. No. 51.222. Blue-green faience; height 8.2 cm., width 6.2 cm.; provenance not known. Reprinted here with the kind permission of Mr. John D. Cooney, Curator, Department of Egyptian Art, Brooklyn Museum. Photograph by courtesy of the Brooklyn Museum.

A Pair of Cups by Paul Revere

A PAIR of cups (Figs. 1-2), unique in our knowledge but by the well-known goldsmith, Paul Revere, has been given to the Museum by Mrs. Guy Lowell in memory of Professor and Mrs. Charles S. Sargent.

The cups were made for Sarah Sargent Ellery, who married her cousin, Ignatius Sargent of Gloucester, a widower of her mother's generation, the fourth from the emigrating William Sargent. Since the cups bear Sarah's maiden initials, one supposes that they were made prior to the wedding date in October 1795 — and are therefore among the earliest instances of Revere's use of their stamps (Figs. 3a & 3b) as his maker's mark. The familiar mark of his surname preceded by a pellet, all in a clear-cut rectangle, made its last distinct appearance, judging by our records, on at least one of the spoons made in February 1796, for Anna Amory, which others of the set bear the pelletless mark a with its somewhat irregular lower line. In June 1796 only a vestige of the pellet remained on the mark stamped on Jonathan Hunnewell's teapot. A tray and sugar basket